

# **Determinants of Quality Teacher Education Program of Private Higher Education Institutions in Caraga Region, Mindanao, Philippines**

**GLYNDA L. BACONG**

bacong\_glenda@yahoo.com

<http://orcid.org/0000-0002-9582-5157>

Father Saturnino Urios University, Butuan City

Gunning Fog Index: 14.53 • Originality: 99% • Grammar Check: 99%  
Flesch Reading Ease: 36.46 • Plagiarism: 1%



## **ABSTRACT**

This study aimed to determine the quality of Teacher Education Program among private Higher Education Institutions in Caraga Region using a descriptive-evaluative method of research. It was found out that majority of the TEIs in the region complied the minimum standard, and exceeded the minimum standard level of compliance in all areas based on CMO #30s, 2004 monitoring. It was also found out in the study that private TEIs had a high percentage rate in LET performance both in BEED and BSED compared to the National passing rate for three years (2014-2016), and good in terms of quality Teacher Education Program. As to the significant relationship between the level of compliance and the quality of teacher education program, they proved to have a significant correlation. Meanwhile, most of the respondents suggested to intensifying admission and retention policy to improve quality Teacher Education Program. Based on the overall findings of the study, a proposed framework to achieve quality Teacher Education Program was offered.

## **KEYWORDS**

Higher Education Institutions, Competence, Compliance, Quality Teacher Education Program, descriptive-evaluative research design, Philippines

## INTRODUCTION

This investigation is anchored on the Principles of Quality System as defined by Lewis & Smith (1994) who forward that the core function of higher education is student learning and this should be emphasized in all discussions of quality and quality assurance. They also mentioned two approaches to assuring quality in higher education – accreditation and outcome assessment.

Accreditation focuses on the inputs of the institution such as student achievement, faculty degrees, facilities, curriculum, physical resources, and administration. The basic assumption of this approach is if high-quality inputs exist, high-quality outputs will result. Meanwhile, outcome assessment emphasizes the importance of evaluating the outputs of higher education such as student achievement, graduation, and employment (Lewis & Smith, 1994).

For Conchada & Tiongco (2015), accreditation is one way that HEIs keep themselves in check with the standards. With the growing number of HEIs in the country and the demand for skilled workers in the global market, there is an urgent need to enhance the quality of program offerings among institutions further. In a similar manner Antiojo (2017) supports that accreditation is a system of evaluation based on the standards of an accrediting agency. He sees it as a means of assuring and improving the quality of education where the focus is the assessment of programs by external accrediting bodies using peer reviewers.

Antiojo (2017) emphasizes the inverse relationship existing between the number of HEIs in the Philippines, which are described as “educational opportunities,” and the level of quality of the educational system in the country. As he puts it, quality of education is affected by the competition between private and state universities, the influx of private low-cost, low-quality, and the absence of a centralized accrediting agency.

Raising the quality of higher education institutions is thus one of the motivations why government agencies such as the Commission on Higher Education are always finding ways to address the issue. Reforms are being set in places such as rationalizing the structure of public higher education and improving higher education budget to ensure resource mobilization and cost-effectiveness (Paqueo, Orbeta, & Albert, (2011).

In trying to improve the quality assurance system of HEIs, the Commission on Higher Education came up with the CHED Memorandum Order (CMO) no. 46 which focuses on learning competency-based standards and outcomes-based system of quality assurance based on the type of HEI. The said CMO seeks to enhance the quality assurance system of private and public HEIs in the country.

First of all, outcomes-based standards or learning competency-based standards is based on a student-centered lifelong learning framework. Outcomes-based education is anchored on the idea that the course content is developed regarding learning outcomes. In this case, the outcomes are the set of learning competencies that enable learner’s

to perform complex tasks/functions/roles (CHED, 2012). This involves a shift from input-oriented curricular designed based on the description of course to outcomes-based education.

Based on the guidelines for the implementation of the CMO 46, inputs may be considered as part of the strategies in achieving the goal. The level of attainment of outcomes shows how much of these aims have been achieved. The outcome-based quality assurance refers to the process of looking at the level at which the inputs, methods, and execution produce the desired learning competencies for the graduates of that program (CHED, 2012). In essence, this means that HEIs should identify quality indicators of output such as the percentage of passing the licensure exam or percentage of employment (CHED, 2012).

A typology-based quality assurance, on the other hand, refers to the establishment of more appropriate quality assurance and development interventions for specific types of HEIs since each has a different vision and mission. It would give a clearer focus on each type of HEIs role in the context of national development goals. The result of this would be increased internal efficiency to ensure that the HEI's programs are comparable to similar programs (CHED, 2012). This implies that HEIs will have to review their program offerings because the programs that they offer should be in line with their vision, mission, and goals.

Our economy needs individuals with high-level academic, technical, behavioral, and thinking skills to improve human capital base and produce a strong labor force, as well as higher education institutions (HEIs) with the capacity to do research and engage in innovation to increase productivity (Di Gropello, (2011). Recognizing the importance of higher education in delivering such skills and research, the Commission on Higher Education (CHED) issued CMO 46 in pursuit of the Government's commitment to the "evolving efforts to recognize and develop a system of comparable qualifications, degrees, and diplomas across the Asia-Pacific region," and the "acceptance of internationally-agreed-upon frameworks and mechanisms for the global practice of professions" (CHED 2012: CMO 46, Article 1, Section 5).

Specifically, CHED has implemented its reform to enable the acquisition of knowledge and develop skills, which will enhance productivity and global competitiveness of students and graduates. This policy direction is therefore very crucial if the government wants to move up the value chain beyond production processes by nurturing pools of well-educated workers who can perform multiple and complex tasks and adapt to the rapidly changing and evolving working environment (Di Gropello, (2011).

This innovative move in HEIs is the rationalization of the quality assurance (QA) processes and procedures in Philippine higher education through an outcomes-based (OB) and typology-based (TB) QA. There are two approaches to the outcomes-based evaluation (OBE). One is program approach, which is a direct assessment of educational outcomes, and the other is institutional, which is an audit of the quality system of

HEIs (CHED 2012: CMO 46, Article III, Section 16). The program approach assesses programs, whether programs meet national and international standards, i.e., “at the level at which the inputs, methods, and execution produce the desired learning competencies for the graduates of that program as determined by the Technical Committees/Technical Panels and as measured by appropriate assessments” (CHED 2012: CMO 46, Article III, Section 16). The institutional approach assesses the whole institutional system, whether it is functional and operational, i.e., whether the systems that support the achievement of the desired learning outcomes are aligned with the “vision, mission, and goals of the institution” (CHED 2012: CMO 46, Article III, and Section 16).

With the implementation of CMO 46, HEIs will have a competitive advantage in the world and the presence of quality assurance (QA) systems will improve HEIs quality of education, which is expected to result in enhanced productivity and competitiveness of students and graduates.

## **FRAMEWORK**

In education, quality assurance is an approach which seeks to measure processes, conditions, and trends to produce the best desirable outcomes. Likewise, it refers to the means by which an institution can guarantee with confidence and certainty that the standards and quality of its educational provisions are maintained and enhanced. The social context of the class is doing the right thing, right on time and every time, seeking zero defects and conformance to requirements, structuring features or characteristics of a product or service to satisfy stated and implied needs and build and sustain relationships (Ganal, 2014).

Article II, Section 1 of the Policies and Standards for Teacher Education, MECS Order N. 26 series of 1983 stipulates: the primary concern of teacher education is to prepare teachers imbued with the ideals, aspirations, and traditions of Philippine life and culture and sufficiently equipped with knowledge of an efficient delivery system.

In support of the aims of the national government to achieve quality and excellence in higher education institutions, this study was pursued to determine the quality practices of Teacher Education Program among the private Higher Education Institutions of Caraga Region. The working scheme started with the assessment of the compliance of private HEIs' Teacher Education Program to standard concerning administration, faculty, curriculum, instructional standard, library, physical facilities, and admission and retention.

Moreover, the quality of Teacher Education Program is another variable for investigation represented by the second box. This variable was measured using Licensure Examination for Teachers (LET), accreditation, research, and extension. The results of the investigation based on the variables in the first two boxes were used as the basis for proposing a framework for a quality teacher education program in the Caraga region.

## OBJECTIVES OF THE STUDY

This study aimed to describe the quality of private Teacher Education Institutions in Caraga region. Specifically, this study sought to answer the following objectives:

- 1 . To describe the profile of the Teacher Education Program;
- 2 . To determine the level of compliance with the Teacher Education Program;
- 3 . To determine the quality of Teacher Education Program in Private TEIs in Caraga region;
- 4 . To trace the significant relationship between the compliance of the standards and the quality Teacher Education Program; and
- 5 . To find the determinants of the quality of Teacher Education Program.

### Hypothesis of the Study

HO1. There is no significant relationship between the level of compliance and quality teacher education.

## METHODOLOGY

### Research Design

The descriptive-evaluative research design was used in this study that looked into the quality of Teacher Education Program of private Higher Education Institution in the Caraga region. It was descriptive-evaluative because it described and assessed the quality of private Teacher Education Programs in the CARAGA Region.

### Research Environment, Population, and Sample

The study was conducted among the private Higher Education Institutions in the CARAGA Region. CARAGA Region is situated in the Northeast section of Mindanao. It was created through Republic Act Number 7901 on February 25, 1995. The region is composed of five provinces: Agusan del Norte, Agusan del Sur, Dinagat Island, Surigao del Norte and Surigao del Sur; six (6) cities: Butuan, Cabadbaran, Bayugan, Surigao, Tandag, and Bislig; sixty-seven (67) municipalities and 1,308 barangays. Butuan City is the regional center.

In this study, the respondents were the twenty-one (21) Private performing sectarian and non-sectarian schools in Caraga region. These schools had been offering Bachelor of Elementary Education (BEED), Bachelor of Secondary Education (BSED) with LET performance for the last three (3) years (2014-2016), Deans /Program Head of private Teacher Education Institutions and College Instructors handling Professional Education subjects.

Table 1 shows the distribution of Higher Education Institutions which offer Teacher Education Program from the different provinces in the CARAGA Region.

Table 1. Distribution of HEI-Respondents

Province	Dean		Teacher	
	F	%	F	%
Agusan del Norte	8	38.1	33	37.1
Agusan del Sur	3	14.3	14	15.7
Surigao del Norte	5	23.8	23	25.8
Surigao del Sur	5	23.8	19	21.3
TOTAL	21	100	89	100

### Sampling Technique

Purposive sampling techniques were utilized in choosing the respondents in the study to consider criteria in the selection. The respondents were the private HEIs that had been offering Bachelor of Elementary Education and Bachelor of Secondary Education for three (3) consecutive years, the Teacher Education Deans, Teacher Education Program College Instructors who are teaching Professional Education.

### Research Instruments

The researcher developed a questionnaire patterned after the accreditation survey and CMO 30s. 2004. There were two sets of tools in the study; it was reviewed by the Research Professors and Education Experts from Philippine Normal University and Father Saturnino Urios University for content validation and were revised based on their comments and suggestions. The survey questionnaires were validated on the bases of the appropriateness of each item.

### Data Gathering Procedure

The researcher sent a letter to the Regional Director of the Commission on Higher Education (CHED) to ask permission for the conduct of the study. Following the approval of the Director of Commission on Higher Education, the researcher sent a letter to the school administrators / Deans of the Private Higher Education Institutions in CARAGA Region requesting permission to conduct the study in their respective schools.

The data for this research were collected using a survey questionnaire. Questions were patterned from CMO # 30 s. 2004, after the expert, validated the survey; these were distributed to the Teachers, Program Deans of private HEIs offering Teacher Education Program in Caraga Region. The researcher assured confidentiality of their survey sheet since the identities were not significant.

### Ethical Consideration

Informed letter of consent was handed to the Deans of College of Teacher Education in the Private Higher Education Institutions in the CARAGA Region and confidentially

was observed all throughout the conduct of the study, by means of removing the names of the respondents and making their data anonymous.

#### Statistical Treatment

The following statistical measures were used in the study to treat frequency, percentage, mean and Pearson-r.

## RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

### On the Profile of the Teacher Education Program

Most of the administrators of Higher Education Institutions in Caraga Region were 66 years old & above (52.39%) and were retirees and launching a second career. As cited by Cochran-Smith, & Zeichner, (2009), an older woman in academia are more fully formed, and they have more years of previous values and habits that have to be displaced to make room for the new ones.

Data revealed that 18 out of 21 or 85.70% of the Deans of HEIs in the region had a doctorate in the discipline and had been conformant to Philippine standards in the offering of a Teacher Education.

Data revealed that 100% of the respondents were on full-time status, which conformed to the Philippine standards in the offering of teacher education program that Deans should be in permanent status in the operating role focus on the day-to-day activities and to get the job done.

Some, 42.86% of the Deans of Private HEIs in Caraga Region had the length of service of more than two decades.

Most of the Deans (42.86%) in Private HEIs in Caraga handled binary functions, and more than nine units teaching load. This result was a non-compliance to CMO No. 30, s. 2004, that if the Program Head has to teach, his or her teaching load should not exceed nine (9) contact hours per week.

In the study of Warr (2011) for individuals, the increased workload has harmful effects on their health and safety at work, such as musculoskeletal disorders, psychological distress, fatigue, and accidents. For organizations, the consequences mainly involve increased absenteeism, staff turnover, and poorer quality. Most of the respondents were engaged in two (2) external affiliation or professional activities and only 6 out of 21 Deans were engaged with more than three (3) associations or professional activities. According to Morrison (2014), participating in any professional organizations provides information about the chosen field.

### Faculty Profile of Teacher Education Institutions in the Region

Most of the faculty respondents (56.18%) teaching Professional Education subjects were Bachelor of Elementary Education graduates and 6.74% were graduates of Certificate of Teacher Education and other Baccalaureate degree.

But it was noted that only 51.69% of the respondents were licensed teachers. The

results revealed that there were teachers who taught professional education subjects in TEIs in the Caraga region who were non-LET passers. This result was non-conformant to Philippine standards in the offering Teacher Education. During an informal interview with the Deans, they mentioned that the fast turnover of licensed teachers was one of the biggest problems they usually encountered because licensed teachers preferred to be employed in public schools for a greener pasture. However, according to Granada, (2018) teachers with more experience are better teachers, ‘ and people agree that teacher quality affects student achievement.

In the study of Riney, Thomas, Williams, & Kelley, (2006), licensure examination helps ensure teachers are knowledgeable and well prepared to enter into a teaching career. Otherwise, schools would be uncertain as to whether the teachers they hire drifted mindlessly through college or learned what they needed to know.

Some, 24.72% of the respondents were full-fledged Doctorate holder, and only 22.47% were full-fledged Master’s Degree holder. This means that some teachers are handling professional education subjects who did not earn a higher ability in education to improve their effectiveness on the job. In consonance to CMO No. 30, s. 2004, a teacher in Teacher Education Program must be full-time; a Doctoral/Master degree holder in Education or a related field.

Kunter et al. (2013) cited that teachers who have had more preparation for teaching are more confident and fruitful with students than those who have had little or none. Furthermore, Ahmad (2012) suggests that teachers need to be trained to play a mentoring role in the teaching and learning process. There are 42 out of 89 (47.19%) faculty members who did not receive any Institutional benefits, and 15 or (16.85%) received only one institutional incentive, some teachers could not finish their postgraduate’s studies. Incentive measures such as salaries, secondary benefits, and intangible rewards, recognition or sanctions have traditionally been used to motivate employees to increase performance.

Lisakafu (2014) purports that motivated workforce by way of salaries. On the other hand, the Private HEIs in Caraga Region had a system to support faculty development to complete master/doctoral degrees in education, attend continuing education seminars, workshops, conferences, and others for them to improve skills. The area on attending seminars and conferences was given more funds by the HEIs in the region (55.06%), but it was found out that the area on Research (17.98%) and financial aid for research paper presentation (6.74%) was the least priorities in terms of faculty development program of the HEIs in the region.

In the study of Evans, Forney, Guido, Patton, & Renn, (2009) he suggests that the idea of having Faculty Development Program empowers learning, and it has to be optimized since having attended seminars and workshop, research and continuing higher education improve and foster students’ development.

All private Higher Education Institutions in Caraga Region complied (100%) the minimum units in the area of the curriculum.

The respondents gave their highest ratings to the areas on the availability of on-campus facilities, memorandum of agreement for off-campus, utilization of relevant instructional resources, availability of teacher's guide, course syllabi with 100%, because these are typically used for training and development of pre-service teachers.

The result showed that private HEIs in Caraga region was conformant to the Philippine standards in the offering of teacher education program CMO No. 52, series of 2007; Section 2 regarding school laboratory for practice teaching. On the one hand, respondents rated lowest on developed instructional materials by instructors/teachers (85.71%), though these are essential because it will help determine the level of learning in any given topic, Instructors see these for primary education only, and many of these materials were not used in college.

Data revealed that most of the librarians in Private Higher Education Institutions in Caraga Region were full-time (80.95%) and Licensed Librarian (66.67%). There were 11 out of 21 TEIs that had full-fledged Master's degree in Library Science, and 9 out of 21 (42.86%) have appropriate training.

Evaluating the results of librarian status per students, data illustrated that most Private HEIs in the region were compliant in terms of library status per students were one (1) Librarian for less than 1,000 students was rated the highest (61.90%), and library at least 5 book titles per course or 66.67%, and had active Journal subscription of periodicals (57.14%), had at least 3,000 Accessioned Books (57.14%) has reading/discussion room (33.33%).

Results revealed that HEIs offered TEP in Caraga Region were non-compliant in terms of standard library requirements stipulated in CHED memorandum order no. 30 s. 2004, where learning resources sufficiency are defined to be crucial to the effective functioning of an institution. It goes to building up a congenial atmosphere, supporting and sustaining the working ethos of a school.

Udoh-llomechine (2010) mentioned that students and Teachers need library resources and the expertise of a librarian to succeed. A school library is an academic library that supports education programs as well as the teaching and learning process. Higher Education Institutions should provide materials to meet the various needs and encouraging readings and the use of the library.

The result indicated that majority (95.24%) of private Higher Education Institutions in Caraga region had legally owned the school building and 21 TEIs had classroom/lecture room with 35 to 50 students' capacity that created a healthier, comfortable atmosphere conducive to learning and had laboratory facilities.

Contrastively, only 4.76% or 1 private Teacher Education Institutions in the region "has at least 1,000 sq. meter" school building area. And there were 12 or 57.14% which had a room for a maximum class size of 50 students per classroom, and the HEIs in the region were non-compliance in terms of classroom requirement with two (2) exit doors.

Ching (2014) puts forward that schools should have at least two exit doors, and they should be widely separated to facilitate emergency exit should one of these be

obstructed. However, the majority of the HEIS in the Region were compliant in terms of the laboratory which “has adequate instructional technology (66.67%). The result shows private HEIs offered TEP needed considerable additional investments to ensure that the schools are healthy, safe, environmentally sound, and built and maintained to support high-quality education.

Getty (2011) stresses that infrastructure and learning resources sufficiency are crucial to the efficient functioning of an institution. It is important that School heads as an Instructional leader should ensure the availability of adequate and appropriate infrastructure and for its permanent augmentation to keep pace with the academic growth of the institution.

The majority of these HEIs had set criteria of course retention (66.67%) and had a system of selective access (61.90%), which were able to develop national qualification examination.

As cited by Kyndt, Gijbels, Grosemans, & Donche, (2016), implementation of admission, retention & progression is important terms of background characteristics including academic preparation prior to attending undergraduate studies. The quality of a student’s previous instruction and his or her preparedness for college-level work can significantly influence whether or not a student will succeed at an institution of higher education.

Based on CHED Memorandum Order No. 30 s. 2004, the core requirement for eligibility for admission of a student to any tertiary level degree program shall be graduation from the secondary level recognized by the Department of Education. TEIs must have a system of selective admission into the programs for teacher education. These criteria shall include passing a standardized admission test.

**On The Level of Compliance among the Teacher Education Program**

The deans from Private HEIs in Caraga Region were asked to rate their level of compliance in terms of seven (7) key areas namely; administration, faculty, curriculum, library, facilities & equipment, admission, and retention policies.

Table 2. Level of Compliance among Teacher Education Institutions As rated by the Deans and CHED Personnel

Key Areas	Mean		Mean Average	Verbal Description
	HEI	CHED		
Administration	3.87	2.93	3.40	Exceeding the minimum standard
Faculty	3.17	2.40	2.78	Exceeding the minimum standard
Curriculum	4.00	2.86	3.43	Exceeding the minimum standard
Library	2.82	1.84	2.33	Practicing the minimum standard

Facilities and Equipment	3.34	2.76	3.05	Exceeding the minimum standard
Instructional Facilities	3.37	3.81	3.59	Exceeding the minimum standard
Admission and Retention	3.41	3.64	3.52	Exceeding the minimum standard
Average	3.42	2.89	3.16	Exceeding the minimum standard

The results in table 2 showed that the level of compliance with the Teacher Education Program had an average rating of 3.42 and curriculum was rated as the highest area with the mean of 4.0. However, it could be noted that the lowest rated area was in the area of a library which with 2.82.

This illustrates that upgrading the level of competency of different areas involving the use of library facilities and resources should be given priority of the private HEIs in Caraga region. The kind and quality of students' performance are dependent on the school library academic support to school programs as well as the teaching and learning process. In consonance to CMO No. 30, s. 2004, Learning Resources sufficiency is crucial to the effective functioning of an institution, and it is essential to ensure the availability of adequate and appropriate infrastructure and for its constant augmentation to keep pace with the academic growth of the institution.

According to Darling-Hammond, & Lieberman, (2013), all aspects of schooling are considered, including curriculum, school/community relations, quality of teaching, time spent by students on a task, and instructional methods.

For Ching (2014), student learning outcomes are the product of the interaction between curriculum characteristics, student learning experience, and individual characteristics. The student learning experience is affected by teacher performance, curriculum characteristics, and classroom environment while Teacher performance is determined by the interaction between teacher competence, curriculum characteristics, and school organizational environment; external teacher education, school-based teacher education, and pre-existing teacher characteristics can contribute to teacher competence.

In contrast, it could be gleaned in Table 2 that unlike the rating on the level of compliance rated by the Deans of HEIs in the Region, CHED rated 2.89 on the compliance of TEIs in seven areas on CMO 30 s. 2004. Instructional facilities were rated as the highest area with the mean of 3.81 followed by the admission and retention with the mean 3.64 and administration as the third in rank with the mean 2.93. In like manner, both of the Deans of TEIs and CHED personnel rated library the lowest area with the mean average of 2.33.

In sum, the results suggested that on improving the quality learner's outcome, there should have been different types of improvement efforts such as a library, administration, faculty, curriculum, instructional standard, physical facilities, admission, and retention, to ensure the quality of the educational effectiveness reaching a certain standard.

**On The Quality Teacher Education Program of HEIs in Caraga Region**

**Licensure Examination for Teachers.** Table 3 presents the LET performance of TEIs for the year 2014–2016. This was used as a basis to determine the LET performance of teachers among private Teacher Education Institutions in the region.

Table 3. LET Performance on National Passing Rate from 2014 – 2016

Year	Takers		Passers		Passing Percentage	
	National	Caraga	National	Caraga	National	Caraga
<b>Bachelor of Elementary Education</b>						
2014	62,160	454	19,348	166	31.13	36.56
2015	70,786	417	25,301	183	35.74	43.88
2016	44,144	474	12,103	228	27.42	48.10
TOTAL	177,090	1,345	56,752	577	32.05	42.90
<b>Bachelor of Secondary Education</b>						
2014	64,792	177	25,755	79	39.75	44.63
2015	77,803	265	26,767	158	34.40	59.62
2016	56,596	338	17,904	152	31.63	44.97
TOTAL	199,191	780	70,426	389	35.36	49.87

Table 4. LET Performance on National Passing Rate from 2014 - 2016

Program	National Passing %	Freq. of TEI LET Passing %			
	Ave. (2014 - 2016)	Below Nat'l. Passing		Above Nat'l. Passing	
BEED	32.05	4	19.0	17	81.0
BSED	35.36	9	42.9	12	57.1
Average	33.71	7	31.0	15	69.0

BSED had an average percentage of 57.1% against the national passing percentage of 35.36%. Closely, BEED had an average passing percentage of 81.0% against the national passing percentage of 32.05%. However, there were 7 out of 21 (31.0%) HEIs in the region that were having a stellar track record for three years and whose performance was below national passing percentage.

Table 5. LET Performance per Caraga HEIs 2014-2016

Verbal Description	BEED		BSED	
	Frequency	Percentage	Frequency	Percentage
Excellent	9	42.86	5	23.81
Very Good	9	42.86	6	28.57
Good	3	14.29	5	23.81
Poor	0	0.00	5	23.81
TOTAL	21	100.00	21	100.00

The LET performance among the majority of the TEIs in the region offering BEED had the highest rating of 42.86% or “Average LET performance percentage is at par or above National passing percentage for 3 or 4 years”. Meanwhile, BSED program, had a rating of 28.87% or “Average LET performance percentage is at par or above National passing percentage for 2 years” However, there were TEIs with a rating of 23.81% whose LET performance was “Average LET performance percentage is below the National passing percentage for consecutive three years” and was having a stellar track record for three years. The result of the study suggested the abysmal performance rate among few TEIs whose LET performance was below the national passing rate.

According to Akiba, LeTendre, & Scribner (2007), Licensure test is one factor that influences the overall quality of teachers and teaching. The belief that testing can improve the quality of instruction force is based on the assumption that the test used is a good measure of the competencies needed for effective teaching and that their salutary effects on training and selection are not outweighed by negative consequences.

**Accreditation of TEIs in Caraga Region.** Table 6 shows the accreditation performance of private Teacher Education program in Caraga Region.

Table 6. Accreditation Performance of Teacher Education

Status	Frequency	Percentage
Non-Accredited	14	66.67
Level 1	4	19.05
Level 2	2	9.52
Level 3 or 4	1	4.76
TOTAL	21	100.00

For twenty-one (21) TEIs in the region, majority of them were non-accredited schools (66.67%). These results revealed that private Higher Education Institutions in Caraga region had not accredited as one means by which an institution could gain eligibility for the improvement of the quality Teacher Education Program.

Conchada & Tiongco (2015), Cited that benefits and incentives derived from accreditation as outlined by PAASCU (2006), these incentives vary on different levels of accreditation. For levels 1 and II, HEIs are granted; (1) Full administrative deregulation, (2) financial deregulation, (3) authority to graduate students from accredited courses or programs of study in the levels accredited, (5) priority in the awards of grants/ subsidies or funding assistance from CHED-Higher Education Development, facilities improvement and other development programs,(6) right to use on its publications or advertisements the word accredited pursuant to CHED policies and rules, (7) limited visitation, inspection and/or supervision by CHED supervisory personnel or representatives.

The same benefits apply to those who are accredited in level III, including (1) authority to offer new courses allied to existing level III courses without need for prior approval, and (2) Privilege to apply for authority to provide new graduates programs, open learning/ distance education, extension classes and to participate in the transnational education. In level IV, the institution is granted the benefits of levels I, II, and III, and as well as full autonomy for the particular program, and as well as the authority to pursue (2) of level III (PAASCU Undergraduates Survey Instrument, 2010).

In general, although there are additional benefits as the levels of accreditation awarded progress, all the said benefits refer to autonomy being granted to the institutions. Accredited schools enjoy minimal interference from the agency, provided that they continue to implement the changes and improvements taken from last (re)accreditation. Said benefits makes the institution’s process both efficient and effective, granted that they do not have to go through so much bureaucracy in waiting for approvals for almost all the main processes. Also, the institutions also get a direct incentives to have an external body to assess their strong and weak points for continuous improvement (Conchada & Tiongco, 2015).

**Research Performance of Teacher Education Institutions in Caraga Region.**

Table 7. Research Performance per Teacher Education Institutions

Research Criteria	Mean	Verbal description
Has a research office that takes care of research activities	2.70	Very Good
Has adequate support for research	2.80	Very Good
Has faculty members who conduct research and published	2.95	Very Good
Has researched to know the conditions/ needs of the outside community	2.91	Very Good
Has faculty members who contributed a research article for journal publication	2.30	Good
Has faculty members who have papers presentations and in local, nationals and/ international	2.20	Good

Has a research journal related academic publication published at least once a year for faculty and students.	2.05	Good
Has researches for policy development/ program improvement in the past 3 yrs.	2.30	Good
Has led or participated in at least one collaborative research across colleges w/in the institution, among institutions and / Go's & NGO's at least 1 a year.	2.30	Good
Has faculty members whose research have an impact on curriculum formulation & instructions.	2.40	Good
Overall	2.49	Good

It can be gleaned in table 7 that the level of implementation of research of the Higher Education Institutions in the region was fair with the overall mean of 2.49%. The research indicator “Has faculty members who conduct research and published was rated as the highest (2.95), and “Has a research journal related academic publication published at least once a year for faculty and students” was rated the lowest with the mean of 2.05. The results further suggested that the majority of the HEIs had been conducting research on specific ways to drive learning and to evolve teachers’ progress in their careers.

Ancheta (2012) cites that research in education is necessary to provide a basis for educational planning. It is one of the main fields that should be embedded in the higher education curriculum. Teacher Education institutions which are actively engaging in research and support research partnerships with schools are most likely to succeed in creating the predisposition to a research-based approach in their students. This is also vital about community extension analytical or reflective practice.

**Community Extension.** Table 8 indicates the level of community extension program of HEIs in the region.

Table 8. Extension Performance per Teacher Education Institutions

Extension criteria	Mean	Verbal Description
Prepare a long term plan for community involvement	2.90	Very Good
Provide a budget for community involvement projects	2.85	Very Good
Participates in the work educational, civic, cultural & religious organization	3.05	Very Good
Undertake research-based community services project	3.00	Very Good
Provide financial aid/other assistance to deserving students	2.90	Very Good
Has provided adequate opportunities/motivation to know the conditions and needs of outside community	2.82	Very Good
Has involvement of the faculty in community outreach	3.05	Very Good
Has community involvement of faculty members	2.75	Very Good
Has monitored, documented and evaluated the impact of community service projects on implementors and beneficiaries on a regular basis	2.60	Very Good

Has established/ maintained satisfactory partnership or linkages w/ the various sector of the community	3.15	Very Good
Has strong linkages w/ local & international institutions	2.45	Good
Has at least one(1) community outreach/ extension programs w/ measurable impact aligned to Teacher Education	2.90	Very Good
OVERALL	2.87	Very Good

The level of implementation of the extension of the Higher Education Institutions in the region was “good,” or “the provisions or conditions are moderately extensive and functioning well” with the overall mean of 2.87.

The extension indicator “Has established/ maintained satisfactory partnership or linkages with the various sector of the community” was rated as the highest (3.15%), and “Has strong linkages with local & international institutions” was rated the lowest with the mean of 2.45.

The findings of the study suggested that private HEIs in Caraga Region had strengthened the relationships they had with the communities served. When students and community members were involved as recipients and participants in community involvement, formal or informal, relevant information could be gleaned and learned in the process. According to Radhakrishna (2014), when projects and course information result in service experiences, the recipients are forced to use the information to make changes, “to make a difference” and to do something with what they have learned.

According to Radhakrishna, Tobin, & Foley, (2014), research and extension system have attempted to work together; however, these two entities remain separate and maintain distinct cultural and organizational identities with a varied, yet linked mission of Teacher Education Program relevant to the goal of quality teacher education.

Table 9 shows the quality Teacher Education Program of private Teacher Education Institutions in the Caraga region. This was used as a basis to determine the LET quality TEP among private Teacher Education Institutions in the region.

Table 9. Quality Teacher Education among HEIs in Caraga Region

Performance	LET Performance		Accreditation status		Research		Extension		Quality TEP	
	f	%	F	%	f	%	f	%	f	%
Poor	3	14.3	14	66.6	1	4.8	1	4.8	5	23.8
Good	13	61.9	1	4.8	5	23.8	3	14.3	5	23.8
Very good	4	19.0	5	23.8	8	38.1	6	28.6	6	28.6
Excellent	1	4.8	1	4.8	7	33.3	11	52.3	5	23.8
Total	21	100	21	100	21	100	21	100	21	100

Table 9 pointed out that the highest frequency in every component of quality Teacher Education Program such as LET performance (61.9% or good), accreditation (66.6% or poor), research (38.1 or very good) and extension (28.6%) had an influence on the result of quality teacher education Program of HEIs in the region.

It can be gleaned in table 10 that the average of the four components was 2.5 with the verbal description of “good” or the programs are limited in extent, but the key components of quality teacher education program are functioning well. And based on the finding on the results, TEIs in the region need to systematically bring up academic standards more than the ordinary and must upgrade the skills and qualifications of students.

Table 10. Summary on Quality Teacher Education Program among HEIs in Caraga Region

Factors	Level	Verbal Description
LET Performance	2.0	Good
Accreditation Status	1.0	Poor
Research	3.0	Very Good
Extension	4.0	Excellent
Quality Teacher Education Program	2.5	Good

Quality in higher education is a multi-dimensional concept which embraces all its functions and activities such as teaching and academic programs, research and extension, staffing, students, faculty, equipment, services of the community and the educational environment. It also requires that higher education is characterized by its international dimension, exchange of knowledge, interactive networking, the mobility of teachers and students, and international research projects while taking into account the national cultural values and circumstances purpose” (Friend-Pereira, Lutz, & Heerens, 2003).

### **On Test of Significance**

Data on table 11 statistically shows the correlation result on the level of compliance and quality teacher education program in the region.

Data pointed out that there was a significant relationship between the level of Compliance based on CMO 30 s. 2004 survey and the Level of Quality Teacher Education in the region.

Table 11. Pearsons Correlation Result between Level of Compliance and Quality Teacher Education

		Level of Compliance	Quality TEP
Level of Compliance	Pearson Correlation	1	.762**
	Sig. (2-tailed)		0
	N	21	21
Quality TEP	Pearson Correlation	.762**	1
	Sig.(2-tailed)	0	
	N	21	21

\*\* Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level (2-tailed).

r Value	p-Result	Result	Decision
0.762	0.00	P 0.05	Reject null hypothesis

Furthermore, Using the Pearson r correlation, the result illustrated that there was a significant correlation at the 0.01 significance level. By this, the level of compliance of TEIs was correlated to the quality Teacher Education program.

The result suggested that private Higher Education Institutions in the region according to CHED Memorandum Order # 30 s. 2004, need to consciously and systematically bring up academic standards more than the ordinary and must upgrade the skills and qualifications of students. In accordance with the pertinent provision of R.A. # 7722 otherwise known as the “Higher Education Act of 1994, and for the purpose of establishing center of excellence and center of development, which requires the Teacher Education Institutions under college or department within the areas of Instruction, research and publication, extension and linkages, institutional qualifications and exhibit an excellent ability to produce quality pre-service teachers education to meet the needs of progressive teachers for elementary, secondary and Special Education Program in the Philippines.

Moreover, Private HEIs in the Caraga region has to conform to the competencies stipulated in Professional Regulatory Commission (PRC) to improve quality Teacher Education program by aligning the existing curriculum of the program to the content standard in an educational system.

Continuing research such as the one undertaken by HEIs must be continued. Research can initiate a study on the success and failure factors that determine the performance of TEIs in the LET, community extension, and accreditation. If education is not based on research and evidence, then it runs the risk of being outdated and not being forward-looking (Ancheta 2012)

### On The Areas Which Influenced Quality Teacher Education Program

Data on table 12 indicated the factors which influenced most the quality of Teacher Education Program in the Private Higher Education Institutions in the Caraga region.

Among the four (4) factors affecting the quality Teacher Education program of the Caraga Region, it is statistically shown that research was the most influencing factor, followed by accreditation, LET performance and community extension program.

Table 12. Stepwise Regression Model Summary

Model	R	R Square	Adjusted R Square	Std. Error of the Estimate	Durbin-Watson	Sig.
1	.808a	.653	.634	.09562		
2	.959b	.919	.910	.04751		
3	.959c	.977	.973	.02610		
4	1.000d	1.000	1.000	.00274	1.873	0.000

a. Predictors: (Constant), Research

b. Predictors: (Constant), Research, Accreditation

c. Predictors: (Constant), Research, Accreditation, LET Performance

d. Predictors: (Constant), Research, Accreditation, LET Performance, Extension

e. Dependent Variable: Quality Teacher

The result implies that research plays an essential role in creating new knowledge, transmitting it to students and fostering innovation. To identify whether teachers are equipped with the conceptual understanding and methodological skills and implementation of the program Higher Education Institutions should conduct research to provide a basis for educational planning and to demonstrate the need for policy makers and curriculum developers to improve the quality Teacher Education program as a whole.

The result further suggested that Private Higher Education Institution in Caraga Region had to improve their level of competence among the administration, faculty, curriculum, laboratory, admission, and retention and adopt more strategic approaches. Eventually, these will be the direct factors or the drivers of change to improve quality Teacher Education program.

Furthermore, Ancheta (2012) points out that integrating research into the undergraduate curriculum is also essential. Research-based curricula provide those professionals working in the education system with a systematic, reflective approach to address areas of need within their respective domains.

## CONCLUSIONS

The level of compliance among Private HEIs in Caraga region in terms of administration, faculty, curriculum, library, physical facilities, laboratory, admission and retention, had exceeded the minimum standard level of compliance in all areas as rated by the deans of HEIs. In contrast to result of the study as evaluated by the CHED personnel illustrated that the level of compliance of HEIs in the region was practicing the minimum standard;

Research was the most influencing factor, followed by accreditation, LET performance and Community Extension program the last;

There was a significant relationship between the level of compliance based on CMO 30 s. 2004 survey and quality Teacher Education in the region.

## RECOMMENDATIONS

Based on the findings and conclusions generated in the study, the following recommendations were offered:

### **For Teacher Education Institutions**

To make this study useful to its purpose, they must upgrade the level of competency of different areas and intensify research because it affects the success and failure of quality Teacher Education Program.

### **For the Commission of Higher Education (CHED)**

It is recommended based on the findings of the study that CHED should closely monitor the level of compliance of private TEIs in the region and formulate relevant educational policies and reforms to sustain the quality teacher education program in the region.

### **For the Department of Education (DepEd)**

DepEd should help the HEIS in out-field teaching and continuous training and professional development.

### **For School Heads**

School administrators must not only meet the specified standard set by CHED, but rather they should take initiatives to enhance or exceed the minimum standards to obtain quality and the findings of this study serve as baseline data in the implementation of the quality Teacher Education program.

### **Teachers**

Since learning outcomes depend on the ability of the teachers to teach, it is

important that they should upgrade their knowledge and skills in teaching. Teachers should undergo seminars and trainings to hone their teaching strategies and be sustaining in term of classroom instructions. Teachers are needed to be supported and encouraged by the Deans, head teachers of their schools concerned so that they are able to use their new knowledge and skills without any hesitations and barriers.

### **For Other researchers**

Those who wish to conduct a study of this subject, this research can be of help. It can be replicated to explore other factors not covered in this study so that new findings can be added to the pool of knowledge.

This study due to lack of resources and time constraints, could not investigate into other critical areas of the teacher preparation programs. Therefore, it is suggested that researchers in education must investigate into other areas of this problem such as teacher preparation curriculum, teacher preparation program evaluation, implementation issues and management issues involved in it.

## **LITERATURE CITED**

- Ahmad, I., Zeb, A., ur Rehman, S., Ahmad, S., Khan, W., Ahmad, K., & Ghani, A. (2012). An Evaluation of the Effectiveness of Teacher Preparation Programmes in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Province, Pakistan. *International Journal of Business and Social Research*, 2(7), 124-131. Retrieved on January 7, 2018 from <https://goo.gl/LW4nJZ>
- Akiba, M., LeTendre, G. K., & Scribner, J. P. (2007). Teacher quality, opportunity gap, and national achievement in 46 countries. *Educational Researcher*, 36(7), 369-387. Retrieved on January 21, 2019 from
- Ancheta, A. D. (2012). Level III Accredited Teacher Education Programs of State Universities and Colleges in Region I: A Case Study. *E-International Scientific Journal*, 4(3), 138-143. Retrieved on January 7, 2019 from <https://goo.gl/DrW1BB>
- Antiojo, L. P. (2017). Performance of Education Graduates in the Licensure Examination for Teachers (LET). *PEOPLE: International Journal of Social Sciences*, 3(2). Retrieved on January 7, 2019 from <https://goo.gl/dVPzdy>
- Ashaver, D., & Mwuese, I. S. (2014). The use of libraries among children in primary schools in Makurdi Metropolis, Benue State, Nigeria. *International Journal of Library and Information Science*, 6(4), 65-74. Retrieved on January 21, 2019 from <https://goo.gl/vQ2GNC>

- Ching, F. D. (2014). *Building construction illustrated*. John Wiley & Sons. Retrieved on January 21, 2019 from <https://goo.gl/6cQu2R>
- Conchada, M. I. P., & Tiongco, M. M. (2015). *A review of the accreditation system for Philippine higher education institutions* (No. 2015-30). PIDS Discussion Paper Series. Retrieved on January 7, 2019 from
- Cochran-Smith, M., & Zeichner, K. M. (Eds.). (2009). *Studying teacher education: The report of the AERA panel on research and teacher education*. Routledge. Retrieved on January 21, 2019 from <https://goo.gl/13jYcM>
- Darling-Hammond, L., & Lieberman, A. (2013). Teacher education around the world: What can we learn from international practice?. In *Teacher education around the world* (pp. 165-183). Routledge. Retrieved on January 7, 2019 from <https://goo.gl/SrHvvN>
- Di Gropello, E. (2011). *Putting higher education to work: Skills and research for growth in East Asia*. World Bank Publications. Retrieved on January 7, 2019 from <https://goo.gl/uJ3aGK>
- Evans, N. J., Forney, D. S., Guido, F. M., Patton, L. D., & Renn, K. A. (2009). *Student development in college: Theory, research, and practice*. John Wiley & Sons. Retrieved on January 21, 2019 from <https://goo.gl/NNyuxS>
- Friend-Pereira, J.C., Lutz, K. and Heerens, N. (2003). European student handbook on quality assurance in higher education. ESIB. Retrieved on January 7, 2019 from <https://goo.gl/A6Nq2Q>
- Granada, W. M. L. (2018). Instructional Competence of the College of Teacher Education (CTE) Faculty Members in one State University in the Philippines. Retrieved on January 7, 2019 from <https://goo.gl/RwK8cj>
- Ganal, N. N. (2014). Level of quality assurance of the teacher education program of state universities of region II: Basis for a monitoring scheme for PNU Isabela Campus. *Researchers World*, 5(4), 48. Retrieved on January 7, 2019 from <https://goo.gl/2g3ksx>
- Getty Jr, J. J. (2011). *A school action plan with stakeholder involvement: A case study of one elementary school*. Wilmington University (Delaware). Retrieved on January 21, 2019 from <https://goo.gl/kFoWp3>

- Kyndt, E., Gijbels, D., Grosemans, I., & Donche, V. (2016). Teachers' everyday professional development: Mapping informal learning activities, antecedents, and learning outcomes. *Review of educational research*, 86(4), 1111-1150. Retrieved on January 7, 2019 from <https://goo.gl/s1iHAJ>
- Kunter, M., Klusmann, U., Baumert, J., Richter, D., Voss, T., & Hachfeld, A. (2013). Professional competence of teachers: Effects on instructional quality and student development. *Journal of Educational Psychology*, 105(3), 805. Retrieved on January 7, 2019 from <https://goo.gl/GXj8aY>
- Lewis, R. G., & Smith, D. H. (1994). *Total Quality in Higher Education. Total Quality Series*. St. Lucie Press, 100 E. Linton Blvd., Suite 403B, Delray Beach, FL 33483. Retrieved on January 7, 2019 from <https://goo.gl/odLCwx>
- Lisakafu, M. D. (2014). *Assessment of public sector employees' Awareness on Labour laws in Tanzania: a case Of Ulanga district council-Morogoro* (Doctoral dissertation, Mzumbe University). Retrieved on January 21, 2019 from <https://goo.gl/koRa9a>
- Paqueo, V., Orbeta, A., & Albert, J. R. (2011). A critical look at the education sector: Achievements, challenges, and reform ideas. *PIDS 2011 Economic Policy Monitor*. Retrieved on January 7, 2019 from <https://goo.gl/8zqzqE>
- Radhakrishna, R., Tobin, D., & Foley, C. (2014). Integrating Extension and research activities: An exploratory study. *Journal of Extension*, 52(1), 1FEA1. Retrieved on January 7, 2019 from <https://goo.gl/rV6hLk>
- Riney, M. R., Thomas, C., Williams, G., & Kelley, B. (2006). National implications: teacher education students' perceptions of state licensure requirements and pedagogical training. In *National Forum of Teacher Education Journal* (Vol. 16, No. 3, pp. 1-7). Retrieved on January 7, 2019 from <https://goo.gl/qGqiUx>
- Visco, D. A. (2015). Predictors of performance in the licensure examination for teachers of the graduates of higher education institutions in Abra. *International Journal of Management Research and Business Strategy*, 4(1), 181-191. Retrieved on January 7, 2019 from <https://goo.gl/aoE7E1>
- Warr, P. (2011). *Work, happiness, and unhappiness*. Psychology Press. Retrieved on January 21, 2019 from <https://goo.gl/KPDb7J>